

WILLOUGHBY-EASTLAKE PUBLIC LIBRARY Special Meeting of the Board of Trustees,  
Tuesday, February 23, 2016, Eastlake City Hall, 4:30 p.m.

## **CALL TO ORDER**

Present: Mr. Buttari, Mr. Monin, Mrs. Petruccio, Mrs. Roche, Mrs. Roseum.  
Mr. Mackey arrived at 5:01 pm

Also attending: Mr. Werner, Mr. Linderman, Ms. Simmons, Mr. Johnson, Ms. Mullen

The meeting was called to order by President Roseum at 4:35 p.m.

## **REVIEW OF SCORING OF PROPOSALS SUBMITTED UNDER THE LIBRARY'S STATEMENT OF QUALIFICATIONS**

- \* Proposals scored by library staff members Rick Werner, Tom Johnson, Eric Linderman, Vicki Simmons, Mollie Burns and Deb Mullen
- \* Scoring categories were approved previously by the Building Committee; weighting of the categories was previously assigned by the Building Committee
- \* Presentations by the 3 firms were held on 2/12/16
- \* All graders saw proposals and presentations
- \* Board presented with cumulative score of the group
- \* All references called were listed by the firms
- \* Scorers were briefed on references in advance of scoring
- \* Prosecutor consulted regarding staff doing the scoring vs the board and this process was approved by the Prosecutor
- \* Score presented for each firm is the final weighted score
- \* Questions from the Board:
  - ~ How were some categories scored?
  - ~ Did some graders score some categories as 0's?
  - ~ See "Other Discussion"
- \* All the references spoke very highly of all 3 firms

## **SUMMARY OF REFERENCE INTERVIEWS**

Tom reviewed Fleischman reference 1:

- \* Cheryl Kuonen from Wickliffe Public Library
  - ~ Add on and reuse/repurposing
  - ~ 10 firms submitted (\$3000 in advertising spent between Plain Dealer and an unnamed architectural trade magazine)
- \* 1.2 budget
  - ~ Final cost came in under budget by \$300,000
- \* Liked the firm
  - ~ Like Jason
  - ~ Found him to be level headed, responsive, and easy to get hold of
- \* Karpinski Engineering firm was sub-contractor

WILLOUGHBY-EASTLAKE PUBLIC LIBRARY Special Meeting of the Board of Trustees,  
Tuesday, February 23, 2016, Eastlake City Hall, 4:30 p.m.

- \* Even though the contract over for 1 ½ years, when new inspector wouldn't approve the previously approved emergency lighting, Fleischman returned and is designing new lighting at no cost
- \* Most jobs exceeded time frame; usually furniture or other unforeseen issues not the fault of architect
- \* Suggestion to set aside additional monies in a fund for changes—ran change orders through that fund
- \* Good communication
  - ~ Held weekly meetings
  - ~ Numerous emails, phone calls
- \* No hourly rate; bid was for the entire project
- \* Would use again

Tom reviewed Fleischman reference 2:

- \* Scott Morgan Cuyahoga County Public Library
- \* Used Fleischman for 8 projects
  - ~ 8 mil, 2 mil, 1.4—all renovation projects
- \* No statement of qualifications as they were previously qualified
- \* All projects came in within \$200,000 below budget
- \* Described Jason as innovative and his designs as having “usability”
- \* Did assist in getting general contractor
- \* CCPL used an Owner's Rep except for the smallest project in which Fleischman served in that role
  - ~ 1-2 mil range like to use the architect as the construction manager
- \* Delays due to sub-contractors
  - ~ Some unforeseen issues caused delays; not Fleischman's fault
- \* Remained in budget
- \* Good communication
  - ~ Weekly meetings
- \* Professional billing
  - ~ Timely, but not overly itemized
- \* Would use again

Rick reviewed HBM reference 1:

- \* Molly Carver: Belleview PL
- \* Selected HBM because they had the most experience of the bidders
- \* Small renovation of Carnegie
  - ~ 2.8 mil budget including contingency fund
  - ~ Came in slightly under budget
- \* Peter Bollek was their main contact
- \* Couple of disputes occurred at the end of the project over additional fees due to change orders
  - ~ Ms. Carver had moved on to another library by that point
  - ~ When she arrived at Sandusky, they were negotiating with HBM over same issue
- \* Mostly interior design; accessibility issues resolved, additional circulation
- \* Good communication
  - ~ Weekly meetings; very reachable
- \* Ran long; took 18 months, but were not HBM's fault
- \* HBM GC

WILLOUGHBY-EASTLAKE PUBLIC LIBRARY Special Meeting of the Board of Trustees,  
Tuesday, February 23, 2016, Eastlake City Hall, 4:30 p.m.

- \* On target with budget; just the disputes at the end
- \* Good communication
- \* Billing was fine
- \* Would use the firm but did have concerns regarding the additional fees at the end

Rick reviewed HMB reference 2:

- \* Tracy Strobel CCPL
- \* Big new construction: Warrensville and Orange
- \* Already had statement of qualifications
- \* Projects ranged from 2-8 million
- \* All over budget because of changes library wanted to make
- \* Complimented both HBM and Fleischman for not trying to impose their vision upon the customer
- \* Architecture and Interior Design services used
- \* Prepared all bid docs and construction
- \* CCPL used an Owners Rep for the big projects
- \* HBM timely where they had control of the issue
- \* Tried hard to control costs
- \* Change order process efficient and smooth
- \* Good communication
- \* Would they use again
- \* Least frustrated by HBM
- \* She commented on Fleischman being used for projects like ours

Tom reviewed TDA reference 1:

- \* Sr. Jacklyn from Notre Dame/Cathedral Latin
- \* 7300 sq. ft. area gutted and repurposed for a media center
- \* 4 firms bid; fired the first firm then went to TDA
- \* TDA previously designed a new gym for them
  - ~ TDA not initially chosen because they feared they would be too traditional in school libraries; NDCL wanted more tech
- \* 1.3 million budget; slightly under budget at 1 million
  - ~ Much design prep is given credit for being under budget
  - ~ NDCL needed money in hand for changes
- \* TDA acted as Owner's Rep
- \* Project over time due to millwork and furniture, not TDA
  - ~ 1 year to completion; slated to be 9-10 months
- \* No billing issues known
- \* Would use again
- \* She thought that there is a big difference between school and public libraries, but TDA could bridge the gap

Tom reviewed TDA reference 2:

- \* Jen S. from Mentor Schools
- \* Media Ctr
  - ~ 2 floor remodel
- \* 1.43 budget; came in at 1.3 final
  - ~ Did need a rebid before process began
- \* TDA did good job meeting needs and wishes
  - ~ Also did a good job paring them down to meet the budget

WILLOUGHBY-EASTLAKE PUBLIC LIBRARY Special Meeting of the Board of Trustees,  
Tuesday, February 23, 2016, Eastlake City Hall, 4:30 p.m.

- \* Very satisfied
- \* Helped get General Contractor
  - ~ Did have some problems with the General Contractor
  - ~ Lowest best qualified—but still had issues
  - ~ Would be happy to talk to us about that if we decide to go that route
- \* Time frame met; had to be ready for school to open
- \* Found asbestos and made that a separate project
- \* Some contingency money left; changes minimal
- \* Good communication
  - ~ Weekly meetings, would use again
- \* Good billing
- \* Also designed a new building staff uses for various functions

Rick reviewed TDA reference 3:

- \* Scott Beatty Dalton Local Schools
- \* New building and library
- \* Budget of 27 million; final amount very close to budget
  - ~ Ohio school facilities process, so some things architect could not do
  - ~ General Contractor controlled by state facilities process
- \* Good communication
  - ~ Biweekly meetings
- \* Architecture and Interior Design
- \* Time frame met yes and no; General Contractor at fault for most delays
- \* Controlled costs; set maximums in the school process very controlled
- \* Assisted with change order process
- \* Good communication
- \* No problem with billing/invoicing
- \* First consideration in future
- \* Abby T and Cynthia very nice job
- \* Did agree that public library would be quite different than school

Other Discussion

- \* We seem to be most similar to WKPL and CCPL in terms of renovation
- \* All scored individually; not in a group
- \* Concerns with the use of 0's or negative numbers
  - ~ Assigned to recalibrate using 1 as the lowest score only, none will have an impact on the final standings.
- \* Although HBM is 2nd place on paper, significant concerns with them
  - ~ Holzheimer took away our Carnegie look in the '90's
  - ~ Difficulties experienced in last project with them
- \* Follow up bldg. committee meeting to standardize the scoring

WILLOUGHBY-EASTLAKE PUBLIC LIBRARY Special Meeting of the Board of Trustees,  
Tuesday, February 23, 2016, Eastlake City Hall, 4:30 p.m.

**RESOLUTION TO AUTHORIZE THE DIRECTOR TO NEGOTIATE A CONTRACT  
WITH RICHARD FLEISCHMAN + PARTNERS ARCHITECTS FOR DESIGN  
SERVICES FOR THE RENOVATION OF THE WILLOWICK AND WILLOUGHBY  
LIBRARIES**

RESOLUTION 23-16

Mr. Mackey moved and Mrs. Petruccio seconded that the Board approve the Resolution and to enter into contractual discussions with Richard Fleischman + Partners Architects for design services for the renovation of the Willoughby and Willowick Libraries.

On roll call the following vote was cast: Mr. Buttari “Yes”, Mr. Mackey “Yes”, Mr. Monin “Yes”, Mrs. Petruccio “Yes”, Mrs. Roche “Yes”, Mrs. Roseum “Yes”. Motion Carried.

**ADJOURNMENT**

MOTION 24-16

Mrs. Petruccio moved and Mr. Mackey seconded that the Board adjourn the meeting at 6:00 pm.

On roll call the following vote was cast: All Ayes. Motion carried.

Respectfully submitted,

---

Board President

---

Board Secretary