

WILLOUGHBY-EASTLAKE PUBLIC LIBRARY Special Meeting of the Board of Trustees,
Tuesday, February 23, 2016, Eastlake City Hall, 4:30 p.m.

CALL TO ORDER

Present: Mr. Buttari, Mr. Monin, Mrs. Petruccio, Mrs. Roche, Mrs. Roseum.
Mr. Mackey arrived at 5:01 pm

Also attending: Mr. Werner, Mr. Linderman, Ms. Simmons, Mr. Johnson, Ms. Mullen

The meeting was called to order by President Roseum at 4:35 p.m.

REVIEW OF SCORING OF PROPOSALS SUBMITTED UNDER THE LIBRARY'S STATEMENT OF QUALIFICATIONS

- * Proposals scored by library staff members Rick Werner, Tom Johnson, Eric Linderman, Vicki Simmons, Mollie Burns and Deb Mullen
- * Scoring categories were approved previously by the Building Committee; weighting of the categories was previously assigned by the Building Committee
- * Presentations by the 3 firms were held on 2/12/16
- * All graders saw proposals and presentations
- * Board presented with cumulative score of the group
- * All references called were listed by the firms
- * Scorers were briefed on references in advance of scoring
- * Prosecutor consulted regarding staff doing the scoring vs the board and this process was approved by the Prosecutor
- * Score presented for each firm is the final weighted score
- * Questions from the Board:
 - ~ How were some categories scored?
 - ~ Did some graders score some categories as 0's?
 - ~ See "Other Discussion"
- * All the references spoke very highly of all 3 firms

SUMMARY OF REFERENCE INTERVIEWS

Tom reviewed Fleischman reference 1:

- * Cheryl Kuonen from Wickliffe Public Library
 - ~ Add on and reuse/repurposing
 - ~ 10 firms submitted (\$3000 in advertising spent between Plain Dealer and an unnamed architectural trade magazine)
- * 1.2 budget
 - ~ Final cost came in under budget by \$300,000
- * Liked the firm
 - ~ Like Jason
 - ~ Found him to be level headed, responsive, and easy to get hold of
- * Karpinski Engineering firm was sub-contractor

WILLOUGHBY-EASTLAKE PUBLIC LIBRARY Special Meeting of the Board of Trustees,
Tuesday, February 23, 2016, Eastlake City Hall, 4:30 p.m.

- * Even though the contract over for 1 ½ years, when new inspector wouldn't approve the previously approved emergency lighting, Fleischman returned and is designing new lighting at no cost
- * Most jobs exceeded time frame; usually furniture or other unforeseen issues not the fault of architect
- * Suggestion to set aside additional monies in a fund for changes—ran change orders through that fund
- * Good communication
 - ~ Held weekly meetings
 - ~ Numerous emails, phone calls
- * No hourly rate; bid was for the entire project
- * Would use again

Tom reviewed Fleischman reference 2:

- * Scott Morgan Cuyahoga County Public Library
- * Used Fleischman for 8 projects
 - ~ 8 mil, 2 mil, 1.4—all renovation projects
- * No statement of qualifications as they were previously qualified
- * All projects came in within \$200,000 below budget
- * Described Jason as innovative and his designs as having “usability”
- * Did assist in getting general contractor
- * CCPL used an Owner's Rep except for the smallest project in which Fleischman served in that role
 - ~ 1-2 mil range like to use the architect as the construction manager
- * Delays due to sub-contractors
 - ~ Some unforeseen issues caused delays; not Fleischman's fault
- * Remained in budget
- * Good communication
 - ~ Weekly meetings
- * Professional billing
 - ~ Timely, but not overly itemized
- * Would use again

Rick reviewed HBM reference 1:

- * Molly Carver: Belleview PL
- * Selected HBM because they had the most experience of the bidders
- * Small renovation of Carnegie
 - ~ 2.8 mil budget including contingency fund
 - ~ Came in slightly under budget
- * Peter Bollek was their main contact
- * Couple of disputes occurred at the end of the project over additional fees due to change orders
 - ~ Ms. Carver had moved on to another library by that point
 - ~ When she arrived at Sandusky, they were negotiating with HBM over same issue
- * Mostly interior design; accessibility issues resolved, additional circulation
- * Good communication
 - ~ Weekly meetings; very reachable
- * Ran long; took 18 months, but were not HBM's fault
- * HBM GC

WILLOUGHBY-EASTLAKE PUBLIC LIBRARY Special Meeting of the Board of Trustees,
Tuesday, February 23, 2016, Eastlake City Hall, 4:30 p.m.

- * On target with budget; just the disputes at the end
- * Good communication
- * Billing was fine
- * Would use the firm but did have concerns regarding the additional fees at the end

Rick reviewed HMB reference 2:

- * Tracy Strobel CCPL
- * Big new construction: Warrensville and Orange
- * Already had statement of qualifications
- * Projects ranged from 2-8 million
- * All over budget because of changes library wanted to make
- * Complimented both HBM and Fleischman for not trying to impose their vision upon the customer
- * Architecture and Interior Design services used
- * Prepared all bid docs and construction
- * CCPL used an Owners Rep for the big projects
- * HBM timely where they had control of the issue
- * Tried hard to control costs
- * Change order process efficient and smooth
- * Good communication
- * Would they use again
- * Least frustrated by HBM
- * She commented on Fleischman being used for projects like ours

Tom reviewed TDA reference 1:

- * Sr. Jacklyn from Notre Dame/Cathedral Latin
- * 7300 sq. ft. area gutted and repurposed for a media center
- * 4 firms bid; fired the first firm then went to TDA
- * TDA previously designed a new gym for them
 - ~ TDA not initially chosen because they feared they would be too traditional in school libraries; NDCL wanted more tech
- * 1.3 million budget; slightly under budget at 1 million
 - ~ Much design prep is given credit for being under budget
 - ~ NDCL needed money in hand for changes
- * TDA acted as Owner's Rep
- * Project over time due to millwork and furniture, not TDA
 - ~ 1 year to completion; slated to be 9-10 months
- * No billing issues known
- * Would use again
- * She thought that there is a big difference between school and public libraries, but TDA could bridge the gap

Tom reviewed TDA reference 2:

- * Jen S. from Mentor Schools
- * Media Ctr
 - ~ 2 floor remodel
- * 1.43 budget; came in at 1.3 final
 - ~ Did need a rebid before process began
- * TDA did good job meeting needs and wishes
 - ~ Also did a good job paring them down to meet the budget

WILLOUGHBY-EASTLAKE PUBLIC LIBRARY Special Meeting of the Board of Trustees,
Tuesday, February 23, 2016, Eastlake City Hall, 4:30 p.m.

- * Very satisfied
- * Helped get General Contractor
 - ~ Did have some problems with the General Contractor
 - ~ Lowest best qualified—but still had issues
 - ~ Would be happy to talk to us about that if we decide to go that route
- * Time frame met; had to be ready for school to open
- * Found asbestos and made that a separate project
- * Some contingency money left; changes minimal
- * Good communication
 - ~ Weekly meetings, would use again
- * Good billing
- * Also designed a new building staff uses for various functions

Rick reviewed TDA reference 3:

- * Scott Beatty Dalton Local Schools
- * New building and library
- * Budget of 27 million; final amount very close to budget
 - ~ Ohio school facilities process, so some things architect could not do
 - ~ General Contractor controlled by state facilities process
- * Good communication
 - ~ Biweekly meetings
- * Architecture and Interior Design
- * Time frame met yes and no; General Contractor at fault for most delays
- * Controlled costs; set maximums in the school process very controlled
- * Assisted with change order process
- * Good communication
- * No problem with billing/invoicing
- * First consideration in future
- * Abby T and Cynthia very nice job
- * Did agree that public library would be quite different than school

Other Discussion

- * We seem to be most similar to WKPL and CCPL in terms of renovation
- * All scored individually; not in a group
- * Concerns with the use of 0's or negative numbers
 - ~ Assigned to recalibrate using 1 as the lowest score only, none will have an impact on the final standings.
- * Although HBM is 2nd place on paper, significant concerns with them
 - ~ Holzheimer took away our Carnegie look in the '90's
 - ~ Difficulties experienced in last project with them
- * Follow up bldg. committee meeting to standardize the scoring

WILLOUGHBY-EASTLAKE PUBLIC LIBRARY Special Meeting of the Board of Trustees,
Tuesday, February 23, 2016, Eastlake City Hall, 4:30 p.m.

**RESOLUTION TO AUTHORIZE THE DIRECTOR TO NEGOTIATE A CONTRACT
WITH RICHARD FLEISCHMAN + PARTNERS ARCHITECTS FOR DESIGN
SERVICES FOR THE RENOVATION OF THE WILLOWICK AND WILLOUGHBY
LIBRARIES**

RESOLUTION 23-16

Mr. Mackey moved and Mrs. Petruccio seconded that the Board approve the Resolution and to enter into contractual discussions with Richard Fleischman + Partners Architects for design services for the renovation of the Willoughby and Willowick Libraries.

On roll call the following vote was cast: Mr. Buttari “Yes”, Mr. Mackey “Yes”, Mr. Monin “Yes”, Mrs. Petruccio “Yes”, Mrs. Roche “Yes”, Mrs. Roseum “Yes”. Motion Carried.

ADJOURNMENT

MOTION 24-16

Mrs. Petruccio moved and Mr. Mackey seconded that the Board adjourn the meeting at 6:00 pm.

On roll call the following vote was cast: All Ayes. Motion carried.

Respectfully submitted,

Board President

Board Secretary